

## An Analysis and Decision Tool to Measure Cost Benefit Of Newborn Screening for Severe Combined Immune Deficiency (SCID) And Related T-Cell Lymphopenia

A Study by the Jeffrey Modell Foundation

© 2013 Jeffrey Modell Foundation



Curing Pl. Worldwide.

### **Objectives of the Study**

- **1.** This study develops a working algorithm or **"decision tree"** that is validated by peer reviewed scientific literature, and harmonized for application to be used by Public Health Departments and Health Ministries in states, countries, and regions throughout the world.
- **2.** Local or regional data can be applied to measure the threshold and economic impact of implementing or not implementing Newborn Screening for SCID.
- **3.** This decision tree will provide the appropriate agency with a usable tool and understandable formula that will assist in deciding upon the willingness to pay for additional years of life utilizing criteria and costs specifically relevant to the locality.



Curing PI. Worldwide.

#### **10 Important Facts to Know**

- **1.** Infants born with Severe Combined Immune Deficiency (SCID), as well as related conditions with T-cell Lymphopenia, suffer from serious, life-threatening infections, and will likely not survive their first year of life without specific therapy to protect them from infections and restore their immune function[1-3].
- **2.** SCID and related conditions can be detected by a simple screening test (TREC Assay) using the same dried blood spot samples already collected from newborns to screen for other genetic disorders[1,2].
- **3.** The TREC Assay provides earliest possible identification before irreversible organ damage or death. Infants receiving hematopoietic stem cell transplantation in the first few months of life, after being identified through screening, have a high probability of survival, and will have the chance to grow up and live a healthy life[1,3-8].
- **4.** While additional laboratory methods are being developed, the current TREC Assay has proven to have outstanding specificity and sensitivity to accurately identify all infants affected with SCID (the primary targets) as well as additional infants with other T-cell Lymphopenia (secondary targets)[1,2].
- **5.** The screening test is 100% sensitive[9]. There has not been a single missed case of SCID since the program began 5 years ago[9].
- 6. The U.S. Secretary of Health and Human Services has recommended that <u>ALL</u> newborns be screened for SCID and T-cell Lymphopenia, characterizing SCID screening using the TREC Assay as "The National Standard for Newborn Screening Programs"[10,11].
- **7.** There are established, dedicated, and specialized treatment centers for affected patients to receive care[12].
- **8.** The cost of the screen is \$4-5 per infant. This includes equipment usage, labor and reagents[13]. More than 2.5 million babies have already been screened[2,8]. The actual incidence of SCID was found to be approximately 1:66,000 and T-cell Lymphopenia 1:20,000. The average was approximately 1:33,000[14].
- **9.** There is a 95-100% success rate of survivorship for babies transplanted in the first three months of life[4-6]. However, the survival rate sharply declines with time[11]. SCID is fatal in infancy if not treated, and as more serious infections develop, it is more difficult to successfully transplant[3-8,15].
- 10. Preeminent physicians from 78 countries were brought together by the Jeffrey Modell Foundation for a three day Global Summit in Berlin, Germany. These expert physicians represent the world's leadership and are authorities in the diagnosis, treatment and management of Primary Immunodeficiencies. At the conclusion of the Symposium, the physicians signed the "Berlin Declaration" calling for the immediate implementation of TRECs screening in order to identify, treat and cure newborn babies born with SCID and related T-cell Lymphopenia (see Appendix 1: "Berlin Declaration").

#### © 2013 Jeffrey Modell Foundation



Curing PI. Worldwide.

#### **Economic Analysis**

The decision to implement Newborn Screening for SCID and related T-cell Lymphopenia will depend on the cost and effectiveness of the screening test, the incidence of SCID and related T-cell Lymphopenia within a population, the cost ratio of the intervention, and the benefit of earliest possible treatment[13,16]. If we make an assumption that the number of births within a region is 100,000 per year, and the incidence of SCID or related T-cell Lymphopenia is approximately 1:33,000 newborns, this decision tree projects 3 cases per year (See Figure 1).

The cost to screen 100,000 newborns, at \$4.25 per patient, totals \$425,000[13]. The cost to transplant one newborn is \$120,000[17,18]. The cost of post-transplant care over the next five years may be as much as \$200,000 for one newborn. Therefore, the cost to screen 100,000 newborns and treatment of one patient would be approximately \$745,000. The cost to screen 100,000 newborns and treat three patients totals \$1,385,000.

If newborns are not screened at birth, they will sustain overwhelming infections and hospitalizations, averaging costs estimated to be at least \$2 million in the first year of life[19,20]. Given the incidence and population, the total costs of care for the predicted three affected newborns will amount to \$6 million in healthcare costs[19,20].

In a previous analysis, Chan et al found that the incremental cost-effective ratio (ICER) was \$27,907 per Quality of Adjusted Life Year (QALY), given 70 years of life saved[13]. This ratio is highly favorable, and also compares closely with other metabolic diseases currently screened[13]. Additionally, this analysis stated that assuming society is willing to pay \$50,000 per QALY, preference for screening occurred if incidence of SCID was at least 1:250,000[13].

In 2011, three U.S. Federal Agencies estimated the value of one life saved to be \$7.7 million[21]. This estimate is an average provided by the Environmental Protection Agency (\$9.1 million), Food and Drug Administration (\$7.9 million), and the Transportation Department (\$6.1 million)[21]. Given this economic information, a newborn baby with SCID or T Cell Lymphopenia that is screened and treated in the first 3.5 months of life, generates a contribution to society that is **at least 15 times greater** than the cost of screening and curative treatment.

The TREC assay is inexpensive, highly sensitive, and has been effectively integrated into public health programs (e.g. Wisconsin, California, New York, Ontario, etc.)[2,14,22]. SCID is a fatal disease that causes accrual of exorbitant healthcare costs in just one year of life[19,20]. The cost of care for just one infant with SCID could be more than the cost of screening for an entire regional population[20]. Implementation of screening through the TREC Assay will provide the earliest possible identification and allow for intervention of early transplantation before infants suffer from severe infections, organ damage, and ultimately death[1]. Newborn screening for SCID and related T-cell Lymphopenia is cost-effective, and most importantly, it is life-saving and allows children with SCID the opportunity to live a healthy life.

#### FIGURE 1:

## DECISION TREE TO CONSIDER NEWBORN SCREENING FOR SEVERE COMBINED IMMUNODEFICIENCYAND RELATED T CELL LYMPHOPENIA





Curing Pl. Worldwide.

#### **References**

- 1. Puck JM. Laboratory technology for population-based screening for severe combined immunodeficiency in neonates: The winner is T-cell receptor exision circles. In: Boyce JA, Finkelman F, Shearer WT, Vercelli D, editors. J Allergy Clin Immunol 2012; 129:607-16
- 2. Routes JM, Grossman WJ, Verbsky J, Laessig RH, Hoffman GL, Brokopp CD, Baker MW. Statewide newborn screening for severe t-cell lymphopenia. JAMA 2009; 302(22):2465-2470
- **3.** Buckley RH, Schiff SE, Schif RI, et al. Hematopoietic stem-cell transplantation for the treatment of severe combined immunodeficiency. N Engl J Med. 1999;340(7):508-516
- 4. Buckley RH. Transplantation of hematopoietic stem cells in human severe combined immunodeficiency: longterm outcomes. Immunol Res 2011; 49:25-43
- 5. Myers LA, Patel DD, Puck JM, Buckley RH. Hematopoietic stem cell transplantation for severe combined immunodeficiency in the neonatal period leads to superior thymic output and improved survival. Blood 2002; 99:872-878
- 6. Patel NC et al. Outcomes of severe combined immunodeficiency patients treated with hematopoietic stem cell transplantation with and without pre-conditioning. J Allergy Clin Immunol 2009 November; 124(5): 1062-9.e1-4
- 7. Antoine C, Muller S, Cant A, et al. Long-term survival and transplantation of haemopoietic stem cells for immunodeficiencies; report of the European experience 1986-99. Lancet 2003;361(9357):553-560
- 8. Hassan A, Booth C, Brightwell A et al. Outcome of hematopoietic stem cell transplantation for adenosine deaminasedeficient severe combined immunodeficiency. Blood 2012 Oct 25;120(17):3615-24
- 9. Baker M. Universal newborn screening for severe combined immunodeficiency (SCID). [PowerPoint]. Atlanta, GA: APHL CDC Newborn Screening Molecular Workshop; 2012
- Sebelius, K. (2010, May 21). Letter to the committee chairperson for the Secretary's advisory committee on heritable disorders in newborns and children U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. Retrieved from: <a href="http://tinyurl.com/l9baeng">http://tinyurl.com/l9baeng</a>>
- 11. The University of Texas Health Science Center at San Antonio (UTHSCSA). National Newborn Screening Status Report. November 21, 2011. Retreived from <a href="http://genes-r-us.uthscsa.edu">http://genes-r-us.uthscsa.edu</a>
- **12.** Modell V, Gee B, Lewis DB, Orange JS, Roifman CM, Routes JM, Sorensen RU, Notarangelo LD, Modell F. Global study of primary immunodeficiency diseases (PI) diagnosis, treatment, and economic impact: an updated report from the Jeffrey Modell Foundation. Immunol Res 2011; 51:61-70
- **13.** Chan K, Davis J, Pai SY, Bonilla FA, Puck JM, Apkon M. A Markov model to analyze cost-effectiveness of screening for severe combined immunodeficiency (SCID). Mol Genet Metab 2011 November; 104(3):383-389
- 14. Kwan A, Church JA, Cowan MJ, Agarwal R, Kapoor N, Kohn DB, Lewis DB, McGhee SA, Moore TB, Stiehm ER, Porteus M, Aznar CP, Currier R, Lorey F, Puck JM. Newborn screening for severe combined immunodeficiency and T-cell lymphopenia in California: Results of the first 2 years. J Allergy Clin Immunol 2013 Jul; 132(1):140 150.e7
- **15.** Buckley RH. The multiple causes of human SCID. J Clin Invest 2004; 114:1409-1411
- **16.** Lipstein EA et al. Systematic evidence review of newborn screening and treatment of severe combined immunodeficiency. Pediatrics 2010; 125;e1226-e1235 doi: 10.1542/peds.2009-1567
- **17.** Hospital Cost and Utilization Project (HCUP), Nationwide Inpatient Database under the auspices of The Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality (AHRQ). ICD-9 CM Principal Diagnosis Code for HSCT
- 18. Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services, Hospital Accounting Records, April 28, 2010
- **19.** Caggana M, Brower A, Baker M, Comeau AM, Lorey F. National SCID Pilot Study. Retrieved from: <a href="http://preview.tinyurl.com/lsanbqh">http://preview.tinyurl.com/lsanbqh</a>
- Kuehn BM. State, federal efforts under way to identify children with "Bubble Boy Syndrome". JAMA 2010 Oct; 304(16):1771-73
- **21.** Appelbaum, B. *As U.S. Agencies put more value on a life, businesses fret* [Newspaper]. New York Times, February 16, 2011; Available at: http://tinyurl.com/mlynth7. Accessed August 16,2013
- 22. CBCNews Canada. 'Bubble boy' welcomes new Ontario screening test. Published online Aug 20, 2013. Available at: <a href="http://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/story/2013/08/20/newborn-screening-bubble-boy-scid.html">http://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/story/2013/08/20/newborn-screening-bubble-boy-scid.html</a> Accessed: August 21, 2013



Immunologists from all Jeffrey Modell Diagnostic and Research Centers were brought together by the Jeffrey Modell Foundation for a three day Global Summit in Berlin, Germany. The physician-experts represent the world's leadership and are authorities in the diagnosis, treatment and management of Primary Immunodeficiencies. At the conclusion of the Symposium, the physicians agreed to the following guiding principles:

- **Whereas** infants born with Severe Combined Immune Deficiency (SCID) as well as related T cell Lymphopenia, suffer from serious, life threatening infections, and will likely not survive their first year of life without curative stem cell transplantation;
- **Whereas** the condition can be detected by a simple screen using the same Guthrie dried blood spot samples already collected from newborns.
- **Whereas** the TREC Assay will provide earliest possible identification before irreversible organ damage or death, and will allow children the chance to grow up and lead a normal life;
- **Whereas** additional laboratory methods are still being developed, but, the current method of screening using the TREC Assay has the specificity and sensitivity to accurately identify affected newborns, with better than 99% accuracy;
- **Whereas** the U.S. Secretary of Health and Human Services recommended that <u>ALL</u> newborns be screened for SCID and related T cell Lymphopenia, characterizing SCID screening using the TREC Assay as "The National Standard for Newborn Screening Programs";
- **Whereas** there are established, dedicated, and specialized treatment centers for affected patients to be managed and receive care;
- **Whereas** the cost of the screen is \$4-5 per infant, and more than 2.5 million babies have already been screened. To date, the incidence of this condition has ranged from 1:35,000 to 1:60,000 of all newborns;
- **Resolved** by the undersigned, calling for the immediate implementation of TRECs screening in order to identify, treat and cure newborn babies born with SCID and related T cell Lymphopenia;
- **Resolved** by the undersigned, calling for continuing encouragement and support of physician education and public awareness relating to all 200 Primary Immunodeficiency disorders. This program has generated a 70% increase in identified patients worldwide over the past 18 months, and includes activities in connection with World Primary Immunodeficiency Week (WPIW) that takes place annually throughout the world during the last week in April.





tithe bulles Jennifer Puck, MD Fritz Melchers, MD Alain Fischer, MD Berlin, Germany San Francisco, California, USA Paris, France University of California, San Francisco Max Planck- Institute for Infection Biology Hopital Necker - Enfants Malades 1.0 Lennart Hammarstrom, MD Jordan Orange, MD Chaim Roifman, MD Houston, Texas, USA Toronto, Canada Stockholm, Sweden Hospital Sick Kids Karolinska Institute Texas Children's Hospital Omar Abuzartown Jula David Rawlings, MD Omar Abuzaitoun, MD Yu Lung Lau, MD Hong Kong, China Nablus, Palestine Seattle, Washington, USA University of Hong Kong Nablus Specialty Hospital Seattle Children's Hospital AZiz BOUSFIHA Bodo Grimbacher, MD Aziz Bousfiha, MD Adrian Thrasher, MD Freiburg, Germany London, United Kingdom Casablanca, Morocco University Hospital Freiburg Casablanca Children's Hospital Great Ormond Street Hospital ames Hubbly no Nina Rezain Nima Rezaei, MD James Verbsky, MD Raz Somech, MD Milwaukee, Wisconsin, USA Tehran, Iran Tel Hashomer, Israel Medical College of Wisconsin Safra Children's Hospital - Sheba Medical Center **Children's Medical Center** Ann Shagedi honoyama Antonio Condino - Neto, MD Shigeaki Nonoyama, MD Joris van Montfrans, MD Utrecht, Netherlands Sao Paulo, Brazil Saitama, Japan National Defense Medical College **University Medical Center University Sao Paulo** Klaus Warnatz (5. ZEOLER Klaus Warnatz, MD Ridha Barbouche, MD John Ziegler, MD Freiburg, Germany Tunis, Tunisia Sydney, Australia **University Medical Center** Institut Pasteur de Tunis Sydney Children's Hospital IN CALVER SAM PAR Curp Prof. Dr. ed. Dr. sci. nat Bobby Gaspar, MD Christoph Klein, MD Troy Torgerson, MD Seattle, Washington, USA London, United Kingsom Munich, Germany Great Ormond Street Hospital Dr. von Haunersches Children's Hospital Seattle Children's Hospital Talal Chatte Stephan Borte Stephan Borte, MD Talal Chatila, MD Isil Barlan, MD Leipzig, Germany Boston, Massachusetts, USA Istanbul, Turkey Municipal Hospital St. Georg **Children's Hospital Boston** Marmara University RICARDO SORENSEN allumit Fred Lorey, MD Janine Reichenbach, MD Ricardo Sorensen, MD Pleasant Hill, California Zurich, Switzerland New Orleans, Lousiana, USA **California Department of Public Health** University Children's Hospital LSU Children's Hospital

Jeffrey Modell Centers Network



JOKE WIS FRANCE	Amos Elizioni	ALESSANDIO PLEADUR
Jose Luis Franco, MD	Amos Etzioni, MD	Alessandro Plebani, MD
Medellin, Colombia	Haifa, Israel	Brescia, Italy
University of Antioquia	Meyer Children's Hospital	University of Brescia
huldades.	Abur y	11
Midellionis		Mierr-
Maite de la Morena, MD	Anne Durandy, MD Paris, France	Darko Richter, MD
Dallas, Texas, USA UT Southwestern Medical Center	Hôpital Necker-Enfants Malades	Zagreb, Croatia University Hospital Center
2 1		
Gon berusente	Enclad Sticken	TADEJ AVCIN
Ewa Bernatowska, MD	Richard Stiehm, MD	Tadej Avcin, MD
Warsaw, Poland	Los Angeles, California, USA	Ljubljana, Slovenia
Children's Memorial Health Institute	Mattel Children's Hospital	University Children's Hospital
Wich Instrum	Cohen Shai	Weller Wahn
	Shai Cohen, MD	
Victor Nudelman, MD Sao Paulo, Brazil	Alon Hagalil, Israel	Volker Wahn, MD Berlin, Germany
Hospital Israelita Albert Einstein	Carmel Medical Center	University Hospital Charite
	T = 2.0	
Husni elagboul	José R. Requeiro	Reem Ahmed Elfeky
Husni Maqboul, MD	José Reueiro, MD	Reem El-Feky, MD
Nablus, Palestine	Madrid, Spain	Cairo, Egypt
An-Najah National University	University Compultense	Ain Shams University
A	25 D Xa	Maria Kanaviou
Alconpta	Kathleen Sullivan, MD	Maria Kanariou, MD
Sudhir Gupta, MD	Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, USA	Athens, Greece
Irvine, California University of California, Irvine	Children's Hospital of Philadelphia	Aghia Sophia Children's Hospital
	Never	A late
aligners H. Sugaride 40	Schriedt, Reinhold E.	Frit Nohn
Lisa Filipovich, MD	Reinhold Schmidt, MD	Amit Nahum, MD
Cincinnati, Ohio, USA	Hannover, Germany	Rehovot, Israel
Cincinnati Children's Hospital	Clinic for Immunology & Rheumatology	Kaplan Medical Center
Eller X	2 cm	Humanaratie
Elisaveta Naumova, MD	Elena Perez, MD	Dinakantha Kumararatne, MD
Sofia, Bulgaria	Miami, Florida, USA	Cambridge, United Kingdom
University Hospital "Alexandrovska"	Batchelor Children's Research Institute	Cambridge University Hospital
Oliv	Zinly	
CAG		Juigs ann Kerns
Peter Ciznar, MD	Zeina Baz, MD	Leigh Ann Kerns, MD
Bratislava, Slovakia Children University Hospital	Beirut, Lebanon St. George University Hospital	Cleveland, Ohio, USA Rainbow Babies and Children's Hospital
Sennet Jaris	Eyal GNneburn	Mikhail Beleutseu
Ken Paris, MD	Eyal Grunebaum, MD	Mikhail Belevtsev, MD
New Orleans, Lousiana, USA	Toronto, Canada	Minsk, Belarus
LSU Children's Hospital	Hospital for Sick Children	Belarusian Research Center for Pediatrics





Ozden Sanal, MD Ankara, Turkey Hacettepe Children's Hospital	Alessandro Aiuti, MD Milan, Italy San Raffaele Telethon Institute for Gene Therapy	Ben-Zion Garty, MD Petah-Tikva, Israel Schneider Children's Medical Center
Ureg Toto linu,   Areg Totolian, MD   St. Petersburg, Russia   St. Petersburg Pasteur Institute	Manuel Grez, MD Frankfurt, Germany Georg-Speyer-Haus	<u>BRADLEY</u> BECKER Bradley Becker, MD St. Louis, Missouri, USA Cardinal Glennon Children's Medical Center
ILAN DALAL   Ilan Dalal, MD   Holon, Israel   Edith Wolfson Medical Center	Sizyakina X. Liudmila Sizyakina, MD Rostov-on-Don, Russia Rostov Medical University	Michael Borte Michael Borte, MD Leipzig, Germany Municipal Hospital St. Georg
Reza Alizadehfar, MD Montreal, Canada Montreal Children's Hospital	MUBRH BLAŽIENE Audra Blaziene, MD Vilnius, Lithuania Vilnius University Hospital	Julia Upton, MD Toronto, Canada Hospital for Sick Children
Katie Convers, MD Katie Convers, MD St. Louis, Missouri, USA Cardinal Glennon Children's Medical Center	Anders Fasth, MD Gothenburg, Sweden Queen Silvia Children's Hospital	Andrew Issekutz, MD Halifax, Canada Dalhousie University
Thomas Issekutz, MD Halifax, Canada Dalhousie University	Ramsay Fuleihan, MD Chicago, Illinois, USA Lurie Children's Hospital	Dr. Necil Katik Galer Necil Kutukculer, MD Izmir, Turkey Ege University
John Sleasman, MD St. Petersburg, Florida, USA All Children's Hospital	<u>Vy</u> Kim Vy Kim, MD Toronto, Canada Hospital for Sick Children	<i>Marina Cusena</i> Marina Guseva, MD St. Petersburg, Russia <b>St. Petersburg Pasteur Institute</b>
Francisco Bonilla, MD Boston, Massachusetts, USA Children's Hospital Boston	Andrew Cant, MD Newcastle upon Tyne, United Kingdom Great North Children's Hospital	B. Walnstein, MD B. Wainstein, MD Sydney, Australia Sydney Children's Hospital
Isabella Quinti, MD Rome, Italy La Sapienza University of Rome	<u>Beatriz T locka Aproethe</u> Beatriz Carvalho, MD Sao Paulo, Brazil <mark>University of Sao Paulo</mark>	Igor RESNICE Igor Resnick, MD Jerusalem, Israel Hadassah-Hebrew University Medical Center
Conleth Frighery, MD Dublin, Ireland St. James' Hospital	Eleonora Gambineri, MD Florence, Italy Anna Meyer Children's Hospital	Ehanafieva S. S. Chanafieva, MD Rostov-on-Don, Russia Rostov Medical University













Jeffrey Modell Centers Network









# The Berlin Declaration

## Jeffrey Modell Centers Summit – July 17 – 20, 2013

Gasper Marxels, MD Ljubljana, Slovenia University Children's Hospital	Femerico J. formo Francisco J. Sosxo, MD Medellin, Colombia University of Antioquia	Rostov-on-Don, Russia Rostov Medical University
Jenny K. Urena, MD Medellin, Colombia University of Antioquia	Yermis Rochon Ametar, MD Medellin, Colombia University of Antioquia	Diana Arocha Hoyoi, MD Diana Arocha Hoyoi, MD Medellin, Colombia University of Antioquia
Sandra Paola Solozor, MD Medellin, Colombia University of Antioquia	Nataja Toblave, MD Ljubljana, Slovenia University Children's Hospital	Mónica Lucia Giraldo Monica Lucia Giraldo, MD Medellin, Colombia University of Antioquia
Alejandra Wilches, MD Medellin, Colombia University of Antioquia	<u>Angela Mario Castaneda</u> Angela Maria Castaneda, MD Medellin, Colombia <mark>University of Antioquia</mark>	Janez Lazbec, MD Ljubljana, Slovenia University Children's Hospital
Marusa Debeljak, MD Ljubljana, Slovenia University Children's Hospital		

